



#### **WEST VIRGINIA LEGISLATURE**

**SECOND REGULAR SESSION, 2008** 

## ENROLLED

FOR House Bill No. 4524

(By Delegates Webster, Mahan, Long, Lane, Proudfoot and Brown)

Passed March 8, 2008

In Effect from Passage

#### ENROLLED

FILED

**COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTE** 

**FOR** 

H. B. 4524

2000 HAR 28 AM 10: 18

(By Delegates Webster, Mahan, Long, Lane, Proudfoot and Brown)

[Passed March 8, 2008; in effect from passage.]

AN ACT to amend and reenact §6B-1-3 of the Code of West Virginia, 1931, as amended; to amend and reenact §6B-2-1, §6B-2-2a, §6B-2-3a, §6B-2-4, §6B-2-5 of said code; and to amend reenact §6B-3-3c, and §6B-3-4 of said code, all relating generally to the ethical standards of public officers, employees and lobbyists; defining additional terms; providing compensation for telephonic participation in meetings; creating a procedure for replacing recused members of the Probable Cause Review Board; altering requirements for pending complaint against a candidate for public office is stayed; establishing a time-frame for candidates to waive stay provisions; clarifying the procedure for replacing recused members of the commission hearing a complaint; providing for exclusive appeal of decisions by the commission imposing sanctions to the circuit court of Kanawha County; permitting personal use of frequent traveler bonus points acquired on official government business; redefining and clarifying what

constitutes a limited interest in a public contract; prohibiting public employees or officials from influencing contracts in which they have a financial interest; providing that full-time public officials and full-time public employees may not seek employment with or be employed by a vendor over whose public contract the public official or public employee exercises authority or control; providing a procedure for granting exceptions to the restriction on purchases of personal property from regulated persons and vendors; providing that public officials and employees may not decide matters regarding a vendor with whom the official or employee is seeking employment or has an agreement concerning future employment; providing standards for determining when public officials may or may not vote on matters involving a for profit or not for profit business, including financial institutions, with whom either they or a an immediate family member are associated; providing that lobbyists must complete an ethics training course during each two-year registration cycle; clarifying that notice of suspension of a lobbyist's lobbying privileges be sent to the affected lobbyist by certified mail; requiring lobbyist complete training prior to lobbying; and making technical corrections.

Be it enacted by the Legislature of West Virginia:

That §6B-1-3 of the Code of West Virginia, 1931, as amended, that §6b-2-1, §6b-2-2a, §6B-2-3a, §6B-2-4 and §6B-2-5 of said code be amended and reenacted; and that §6B-3-3c, and §6B-3-4 be amended and reenacted, all to read as follows:

ARTICLE 1. SHORT TITLE; LEGISLATIVE FINDINGS,
PURPOSES AND INTENT;
CONSTRUCTION AND APPLICATION OF
CHAPTER; SEVERABILITY.

§6B-1-3. Definitions.

- 3 (a) "Review Board" means the Probable Cause Review4 Board created by section two-a, article two of this chapter.
- (b) "Business" means any entity through which business
   for profit is conducted including a corporation, partnership,
   proprietorship, franchise, association, organization or self employed individual.
- 9 (c) "Compensation" means money, thing of value or 10 financial benefit. The term "compensation" does not include 11 reimbursement for actual reasonable and necessary expenses 12 incurred in the performance of one's official duties.
- (d) "Employee" means any person in the service of another under any contract of hire, whether express or implied, oral or written, where the employer or an agent of the employer or a public official has the right or power to control and direct such person in the material details of how work is to be performed and who is not responsible for the making of policy nor for recommending official action.
  - (e) "Ethics Commission" or "commission" means the West Virginia Ethics Commission.

- (f) "Immediate family", with respect to an individual, means a spouse with whom the individual is living as husband and wife and any dependent child or children, dependent grandchild or grandchildren and dependent parent or parents.
- 27 (g) "Ministerial functions" means actions or functions 28 performed by an individual under a given state of facts in a 29 prescribed manner in accordance with a mandate of legal 30 authority, without regard to, or without the exercise of, the

- 31 individual's own judgment as to the propriety of the action
- 32 being taken.
- 33 (h) "Person" means an individual, corporation, business
- 34 entity, labor union, association, firm, partnership, limited
- 35 partnership, committee, club or other organization or group
- 36 of persons, irrespective of the denomination given such
- 37 organization or group.
- 38 (i) "Political contribution" means and has the same
- 39 definition as is given that term under the provisions of article
- 40 eight, chapter three of this code.
- 41 (j) "Public employee" means any full-time or part-time
- 42 employee of any state, county or municipal governmental
- body or any political subdivision thereof, including county
- 44 school boards.
- (k) "Public official" means any person who is elected or
- 46 appointed to any state, county or municipal office or position
- 47 and who is responsible for the making of policy or takes
- official action which is either ministerial or nonministerial, or
- both, with respect to: (1) Contracting for, or procurement of,
- 50 goods or services; (2) administering or monitoring grants or
- subsidies; (3) planning or zoning; (4) inspecting, licensing,
- regulating or auditing any person; or (5) any other activity
- where the official action has an economic impact of greater
- than a de minimis nature on the interest or interests of any
- 55 person.
- 56 (l) "Relative" means spouse, mother, father, sister,
- 57 brother, son, daughter, grandmother, grandfather, grandchild,
- mother-in-law, father-in-law, sister-in-law, brother-in-law,
- 59 son-in-law or daughter-in-law.
- (m) "Respondent" means a person who is the subject of
- 61 an investigation by the commission or against whom a
- 62 complaint has been filed with the commission.

(n) "Thing of value", "other thing of value" or "anything 63 64 of value" means and includes: (1) Money, bank bills or notes, 65 United States treasury notes and other bills, bonds or notes issued by lawful authority and intended to pass and circulate 66 67 as money; (2) goods and chattels; (3) promissory notes, bills 68 of exchange, orders, drafts, warrants, checks, bonds given for 69 the payment of money or the forbearance of money due or 70 owing; (4) receipts given for the payment of money or other 71 property; (5) any right or chose in action; (6) chattels real or 72 personal or things which savor of realty and are, at the time 73 taken, a part of a freehold, whether they are of the substance 74 or produce thereof or affixed thereto, although there may be 75 no interval between the severing and the taking away thereof; 76 (7) any interest in realty, including, but not limited to, fee 77 simple estates, life estates, estates for a term or period of 78 time, joint tenancies, cotenancies, tenancies in common, 79 partial interests, present or future interests, contingent or 80 vested interests, beneficial interests, leasehold interests or any 81 other interest or interests in realty of whatsoever nature; (8) 82 any promise of employment, present or future; (9) donation 83 or gift; (10) rendering of services or the payment thereof; 84 (11) any advance or pledge; (12) a promise of present or future interest in any business or contract or other agreement; 85 86 or (13) every other thing or item, whether tangible or intangible, having economic worth. "Thing of value", "other 87 88 thing of value" or "anything of value" shall not include 89 anything which is de minimis in nature nor a lawful political 90 contribution reported as required by law.

# ARTICLE 2. WEST VIRGINIA ETHICS COMMISSION; POWERS AND DUTIES; DISCLOSURE OF FINANCIAL INTEREST BY PUBLIC OFFICIALS AND EMPLOYEES; APPEARANCES BEFORE PUBLIC AGENCIES; CODE OF CONDUCT FOR ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES.

- (a) There is hereby created the West Virginia Ethics 1 2 Commission, consisting of twelve members, no more than 3 seven of whom shall be members of the same political party. 4 The members of the commission shall be appointed by the Governor with the advice and consent of the Senate. Within 5 6 thirty days of the effective date of this section, the Governor 7 shall make the initial appointments to the commission. No 8 person may be appointed to the commission or continue to serve as a member of the commission who holds elected or 9 10 appointed office under the government of the United States, 11 the State of West Virginia or any of its political subdivisions, or who is a candidate for any of those offices, who is 12 13 employed as a registered lobbyist, or who is otherwise subject to the provisions of this chapter other than by reason 14 15 of his or her appointment to or service on the commission. A 16 member may contribute to a political campaign, but no 17 member shall hold any political party office or participate in 18 a campaign relating to a referendum or other ballot issue.
- 19 (b) At least two members of the commission shall have 20 served as a member of the West Virginia Legislature; at least 21 two members of the commission shall have been employed in a full-time elected or appointed office in state government; 22 at least one member shall have served as an elected official 23 24 in a county or municipal government or on a county school 25 board; at least one member shall have been employed full-26 time as a county or municipal officer or employee; and at 27 least two members shall have served part time as a member 28 or director of a state, county or municipal board, commission or public service district and at least four members shall be 29 30 selected from the public at large. No more than four members 31 of the commission shall reside in the same congressional 32 district.

37

38

39

40 41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

5556

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

6465

66

67

(c) Of the initial appointments made to the commission, two shall be for a term ending one year after the effective date of this section, two for a term ending two years after the effective date of this section, two for a term ending three years after the effective date of this section, three for a term ending four years after the effective date of this section and three shall be for terms ending five years after the effective date of this section. Thereafter, terms of office shall be for five years, each term ending on the same day of the same month of the year as did the term which it succeeds. Each member shall hold office from the date of his or her appointment until the end of the term for which he or she was appointed or until his or her successor qualifies for office. When a vacancy occurs as a result of death, resignation or removal in the membership of this commission, it shall be filled by appointment within thirty days of the vacancy for the unexpired portion of the term in the same manner as original appointments. No member shall serve more than two consecutive full or partial terms and no person may be reappointed to the commission until at least two years have elapsed after the completion of a second successive term.

(d) Each member of the commission shall take and subscribe to the oath or affirmation required pursuant to section five, article IV of the Constitution of West Virginia. A member may be removed by the Governor for substantial neglect of duty, gross misconduct in office or violation of this chapter, after written notice and opportunity for reply.

(e) The commission shall meet within thirty days of the initial appointments to the commission at a time and place to be determined by the Governor, who shall designate a member to preside at that meeting until a chairman is elected. At its first meeting, the commission shall elect a chairman and other officers as are necessary. The commission shall within ninety days after its first meeting adopt rules for its procedures.

86

87

88 89

90

91

92

93

94

95 96

97

98

99

100

101

- 68 (f) Seven members of the commission shall constitute a 69 quorum, except that when the commission is sitting as a 70 hearing board pursuant to section four of this article, then 71 five members shall constitute a quorum. Except as may be 72 otherwise provided in this article, a majority of the total 73 membership shall be necessary to act at all times.
- 74 (g) Members of the commission shall receive the same 75 compensation and expense reimbursement as is paid to 76 members of the Legislature for their interim duties as 77 recommended by the Citizens Legislative Compensation 78 Commission and authorized by law for each day or portion 79 thereof engaged in the discharge of official duties: *Provided*, 80 That to be eligible for compensation and expense 81 reimbursement, the member must participate in a meeting or 82 adjudicatory session: Provided, however, That the member is 83 not eligible for expense reimbursement if he or she does not 84 attend a meeting or adjudicatory session in person.
  - (h) The commission shall appoint an executive director to assist the commission in carrying out its functions in accordance with commission rules and with applicable law. The executive director shall be paid a salary fixed by the commission or as otherwise provided by law. The commission shall appoint and discharge counsel and employees and shall fix the compensation of employees and prescribe their duties. Counsel to the commission shall advise the commission on all legal matters and on the instruction of the commission may commence appropriate civil actions: Provided, That no counsel shall both advise the commission and act in a representative capacity in any proceeding.
  - (i) The commission may delegate authority to the chairman or executive director to act in the name of the commission between meetings of the commission, except that the commission shall not delegate the power to hold hearings and determine violations to the chairman or executive director.

106 107

108 109

110

- (j) The principal office of the commission shall be in the seat of government but it or its designated subcommittees may meet and exercise its power at any other place in the state. Meetings of the commission shall be public unless: (1) They are required to be private by the provisions of this chapter relating to confidentiality; or (2) they involve discussions of commission personnel, planned or ongoing litigation and planned or ongoing investigations.
- 111 (k) Meetings of the commission shall be upon the call of 112 the chair and may be conducted by telephonic or other 113 electronic conferencing: *Provided*, That telephone or other 114 electronic conferencing and voting are not permitted when 115 the commission is acting as a hearing board under section 116 four of this article or when the Probable Cause Review Board 117 meets to receive an oral response as authorized under 118 subsection (d), section four of this article. Members shall be 119 given notice of meetings held by telephone or other 120 electronic conferencing in the same manner as meetings at 121 which the members are required to attend in person. 122 Telephone or other electronic conferences shall be 123 electronically recorded and the recordings shall be retained 124 by the commission in accordance with its record retention 125 policy.

#### §6B-2-2a. Probable Cause Review Board.

- 1 (a) There is hereby established a Probable Cause Review
- 2 Board that shall conduct hearings to determine whether there
- 3 is probable cause to believe that a violation of the West
- 4 Virginia Governmental Ethics Act has occurred and, if so, to
- 5 refer that investigation to the Ethics Commission. The
- 6 Review Board is an autonomous board, not under the
- 7 direction or control of the Ethics Commission. The Review
- 8 Board will review complaints received or initiated by the
- 9 Ethics Commission to make a threshold determination of
- 10 whether probable cause exists to believe that a violation of
- 11 the West Virginia Governmental Ethics Act has occurred.

34

35

3637

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

12 (b) The Governor, by and with the advice and consent of 13 the Senate, shall appoint three persons as members of the 14 Review Board, each of whom shall be a resident and citizen 15 of the state. Each member of the Review Board shall hold 16 office until his or her successor has been appointed and 17 qualified. At least one member of the board must be an 18 attorney licensed by the State of West Virginia and no more 19 than two members can belong to the same political party. The 20 members of the Review Board shall be appointed for 21 overlapping terms of two years, except that the original 22 appointments shall be for terms of one, two and three years, 23 respectively. Any member whose term expires may be 24 reappointed by the Governor. In the event a Review Board 25 member is unable to complete his or her term, the Governor 26 shall appoint a person with similar qualification to complete that term. Each Review Board member shall receive the 27 same compensation and expense reimbursement as provided 28 29 to Ethics Commission members pursuant to section one of 30 this article. These and all other costs incurred by the Review 31 Board shall be paid from the budget of the Ethics 32 Commission.

- (c) No person may be appointed to the Review Board or continue to serve as a member of the Review Board who holds elected or appointed office under the government of the United States, the State of West Virginia or any of its political subdivisions, or who is a candidate for any of such offices, or who is a registered lobbyist, or who is otherwise subject to the provisions of this chapter other than by reason of his or her appointment to or service on the Review Board. A Review Board member may contribute to a political campaign, but no member shall hold any political party office or participate in a campaign relating to a referendum or other ballot issue.
- 45 (d) Members of the Review Board may recuse themselves 46 from a particular case upon their own motion, with the

48 for good cause shown, upon motion of a party. The remaining

49 members of the Review Board may, by majority vote, select

- a temporary member to replace a recused member: *Provided*,
- 51 That the temporary member selected to replace a recused
- 52 member shall be a person who meets all requirements for
- appointment provided by subsection (c), section two-a of this
- 54 article, and whose political affiliation is the same as the
- 55 recused member.
- 56 (e) The Ethics Commission shall propose, for approval by
- 57 the Review Board, any procedural and interpretative rules
- 58 governing the operation of the Review Board. The
- 59 commission shall propose these rules pursuant to article
- 60 three, chapter twenty-nine-a of the code.
- 61 (f) The Ethics Commission shall provide staffing and a
- 62 location for the Review Board to conduct hearings. The
- 63 Ethics Commission is authorized to employ and assign the
- 64 necessary professional and clerical staff to assist the Review
- Board in the performance of its duties and commission staff
- shall, as the commission deems appropriate, also serve as
- 67 staff to the Review Board. All investigations and proceedings
- of the Review Board are deemed confidential as provided in
- 69 section four of this article and members of the Review Board
- are bound to the same confidentiality requirements applicable
- 71 to the Ethics Commission pursuant to this article.
- 72 (g) The Review Board may subpoena witnesses, compel
- 73 their attendance and testimony, administer oaths and
- 74 affirmations, take evidence and require by subpoena the
- 75 production of books, papers, records or other evidence
- 76 needed for the performance of the Review Board's duties.
- 77 (h) Upon decision by the Review Board that probable
- 78 cause exists to believe that a violation of this chapter has
- 79 occurred, commission staff shall send notice to the

- 80 commission members of the Review Board's finding. After an
- 81 cthics complaint has been submitted to the Review Board in
- 82 accordance with section four of this article, the commission
- 83 may take no further action until it receives the Review
- 84 Board's probable cause finding.

#### §6B-2-3a. Complaints.

- 1 (a) The commission may commence an investigation,
- 2 pursuant to section four of this article, on the filing of a
- 3 complaint duly verified by oath or affirmation, by any
- 4 person.
- 5 (b) The commission may order the executive director to
- 6 prepare a complaint, upon a majority affirmative vote of its
- 7 members, if it receives or discovers credible information
- 8 which, if true, would merit an inquiry into whether a
- 9 violation of this article has occurred.
- (c) (1) No complaint may be accepted or initiated by the
- 11 commission against a public official or public employee
- during the sixty days before a primary or general election at
- which the public official or public employees is a candidate
- 14 for elective office.
- 15 (2) If a complaint is pending against a public official or
- 16 public employee who is also a candidate for public office,
- 17 then the commission shall stay the processing of the
- complaint for the sixty day time period preceding the primary
- 19 election or general election, or both, unless the candidate
- 20 waives the stay in writing. If the commission receives a
- 21 written waiver of the stay at least sixty days prior to the
- 22 election, and if the Review Board has not yet ruled whether
- probable cause exists to believe there has been a violation of
- 24 the Ethics Act, then the Review Board will process the
- 25 complaint and make a probable cause determination at least
- 26 thirty days prior to the election: Provided, That, the stay

- 27 provisions of this subdivision do not apply to complaints
- 28 which have already been adjudicated by the commission and
- 29 are pending on appeal.
- 30 (3) For purposes of this subsection, any provisions of this
- chapter setting time periods for initiating a complaint or for 31
- performing any other action are considered tolled until after 32
- 33 the election at which the public official or public employee
- candidate stands for elective office. 34

#### §6B-2-4. Processing complaints; dismissals; hearings; disposition; judicial review.

- (a) Upon the filing of a complaint, the Executive Director 1
- 2 of the commission or his or her designee shall, within three
- 3 working days, acknowledge the receipt of the complaint by
- 4 first-class mail unless the complaint was initiated by the
- 5 commission or the complainant or his or her representative
- 6 personally filed the complaint with the commission and was
- 7 given a receipt or other acknowledgment evidencing the
- 8 filing of the complaint. No political party or officer,
- 9 employee or agent of a political party acting in his or her
- 10 official capacity may file a complaint for a violation of this
- 11 chapter with the commission. Nothing in this section
- 12
- prohibits a private citizen, acting in that capacity, from filing 13
- a verified complaint with the commission under this section.
- 14 Within fourteen days after the receipt of a complaint, the
- 15 Executive Director shall refer the complaint to the Review
- 16 Board created pursuant to section two-a of this article.
- 17 (b) Upon the referral of a complaint by the Executive
- 18 Director pursuant to subsection (a) of this section, the Review
- 19 Board shall determine whether the allegations of the
- 20 complaint, if taken as true, would constitute a violation of
- 21 law upon which the commission could properly act under the
- provisions of this chapter. If the complaint is determined by 22
- 23 a majority vote of the Review Board to be insufficient in this
- regard, the Review Board shall dismiss the complaint. 24

(d) Within the 45-day period following the mailing of a notice of investigation, the Review Board shall proceed to consider(1) The allegations raised in the complaint; (2) Any timely received written response of the respondent; and (3) Any other competent evidence gathered by or submitted to the commission which has a proper bearing on the issue of probable cause. A respondent may appear before the Review Board and make an oral response to the complaint. The commission shall promulgate rules prescribing the manner in which a respondent may present his or her oral response. The commission may ask a respondent to disclose specific amounts received from a source and request other detailed information not otherwise required to be set forth in a statement or report filed under the provisions of this chapter if the information sought is considered to be probative as to

the issues raised by a complaint or an investigation initiated by the commission. Any information thus received shall be confidential except as provided by subsection (e) of this section. If a person asked to provide information fails or refuses to furnish the information to the commission, the commission may exercise its subpoena power as provided in this chapter and any subpoena issued by the commission shall have the same force and effect as a subpoena issued by a circuit court of this state. Enforcement of any subpoena may be had upon application to a circuit court of the county in which the Review Board is conducting an investigation through the issuance of a rule or an attachment against the respondent as in cases of contempt.

- (e) All investigations, complaints, reports, records, proceedings and other information received by the commission and related to complaints made to the commission or investigations conducted by the commission pursuant to this section, including the identity of the complainant or respondent, are confidential and may not be knowingly and improperly disclosed by any current or former member or employee of the commission or the Review Board except as follows:
- (A) Once there has been a finding that probable cause exists to believe that a respondent has violated the provisions of this chapter and the respondent has been served by the commission with a copy of the Review Board's order and the statement of charges prepared pursuant to the provisions of subsection (g) of this section, the complaint and all reports, records, nonprivileged and nondeliberative material introduced at any probable cause hearing held pursuant to the complaint cease to be confidential.
- 92 (B) After a finding of probable cause, any subsequent 93 hearing held in the matter for the purpose of receiving 94 evidence or the arguments of the parties or their

- 95 representatives shall be open to the public and all reports,
- 96 records and nondeliberative materials introduced into
- 97 evidence at the hearing, as well as the commission's orders,
- 98 are not confidential.
- (C) The commission may release any information relating to an investigation at any time if the release has been agreed to in writing by the respondent.
- 102 (D) The complaint and the identity of the complainant 103 shall be disclosed to a person named as respondent 104 immediately upon the respondent's request.
- (E) Where the commission is otherwise required by the provisions of this chapter to disclose information or to proceed in such a manner that disclosure is necessary and required to fulfill those requirements.
- 109 (2) If, in a specific case, the commission finds that there 110 is a reasonable likelihood that the dissemination of 111 information or opinion in connection with a pending or 112 imminent proceeding will interfere with a fair hearing or 113 otherwise prejudice the due administration of justice, the 114 commission shall order that all or a portion of the information 115 communicated to the commission to cause an investigation 116 and all allegations of ethical misconduct or criminal acts 117 contained in a complaint shall be confidential and the person 118 providing the information or filing a complaint shall be 119 bound to confidentiality until further order of the 120 commission.
- 121 (f) If the members of the Review Board fail to find 122 probable cause, the proceedings shall be dismissed by the 123 commission in an order signed by the members of the Review 124 Board. Copies of the order of dismissal shall be sent to the 125 complainant and served upon the respondent forthwith. If the 126 Review Board decides by a unanimous vote that there is

probable cause to believe that a violation under this chapter has occurred, the members of the Review Board shall sign an order directing the commission staff to prepare a statement of charges and assign the matter for hearing to the commission or a hearing examiner as the Commission may subsequently direct. The commission shall then schedule a hearing, to be held within ninety days after the date of the order, to determine the truth or falsity of the charges. The commission's review of the evidence presented shall be de novo. For the purpose of this section, service of process upon the respondent is obtained at the time the respondent or the respondent's agent physically receives the process, regardless of whether the service of process is in person or by certified mail.

- (g) At least eighty days prior to the date of the hearing, the commission shall serve the respondent by certified mail, return receipt requested, with the statement of charges and a notice of hearing setting forth the date, time and place for the hearing. The scheduled hearing may be continued only upon a showing of good cause by the respondent or under other circumstances as the commission, by legislative rule, directs.
- (h) The Commission may sit as a hearing board to adjudicate the case or may permit an assigned hearing examiner employed by the commission to preside at the taking of evidence. The commission shall, by legislative rule, establish the general qualifications for hearing examiners. The legislative rule shall also contain provisions which ensure that the functions of a hearing examiner will be conducted in an impartial manner and describe the circumstances and procedures for disqualification of hearing examiners.
- (i) A member of the commission or a hearing examiner presiding at a hearing may:

- (1) Administer oaths and affirmations, compel the
- 161 attendance of witnesses and the production of documents,
- examine witnesses and parties and otherwise take testimony
- and establish a record:
- (2) Rule on offers of proof and receive relevant evidence;
- 165 (3) Take depositions or have depositions taken when the ends of justice will be served;
- (4) Regulate the course of the hearing;
- (5) Hold conferences for the settlement or simplificationof issues by consent of the parties;
- (6) Dispose of procedural requests or similar matters;
- 171 (7) Accept stipulated agreements:
- 172 (8) Take other action authorized by the Ethics 173 Commission consistent with the provisions of this chapter.
- (j) With respect to allegations of a violation under this
- chapter, the complainant has the burden of proof. The West
- 176 Virginia Rules of Evidence governing proceedings in the
- 177 courts of this state shall be given like effect in hearings held
- 178 before the commission or a hearing examiner. The
- 179 commission shall, by rule, regulate the conduct of hearings so
- as to provide full procedural due process to a respondent.
- 181 Hearings before a hearing examiner shall be recorded
- 182 electronically. When requested by either of the parties, the
- 183 presiding officer shall order a transcript, verified by oath or
- 184 affirmation, of each hearing held and so recorded. In the
- discretion of the commission, a record of the proceedings
- may be made by a certified court reporter. Unless otherwise
- ordered by the commission, the cost of preparing a transcript
- shall be paid by the party requesting the transcript. Upon a

198

199

200

201

202

203

- (k) The recording of the hearing or the transcript of testimony, as the case may be, and the exhibits, together with all papers and requests filed in the proceeding, and the proposed findings of fact of the hearing examiner and the parties, constitute the exclusive record for decision by the commission, unless by leave of the commission a party is permitted to submit additional documentary evidence or take and file depositions or otherwise exercise discovery.
- 205 (1) The commission shall set a time and place for the 206 hearing of arguments by the complainant and respondent, or 207 their respective representatives, and shall notify the parties 208 thereof. Briefs may be filed by the parties in accordance with 209 procedural rules promulgated by the commission. The 210 commission shall issue a final decision in writing within 211 forty-five days of the receipt of the entire record of a hearing 212 held before a hearing examiner or, in the case of an 213 evidentiary hearing held by the commission acting as a 214 hearing board in lieu of a hearing examiner, within twenty-215 one days following the close of the evidence.
- 216 (m) A decision on the truth or falsity of the charges 217 against the respondent and a decision to impose sanctions 218 must be approved by at least seven members of the 219 commission.
- (n) Members of the commission shall recuse themselves from a particular case upon their own motion with the

- 222 approval of the commission or for good cause shown upon 223 motion of a party. The remaining members of the commission may, by majority vote, select a temporary 224 225 member to replace a recused member: Provided, That the 226 temporary member selected to replace a recused member 227 shall be a person of the same status or category, provided by 228 subsection (b), section one of this article, as the recused 229 member.
- 230 (o) Except for statements made in the course of official 231 duties to explain commission procedures, no member or 232 employee or former member or employee of the commission 233 may make any public or nonpublic comment about any 234 proceeding previously or currently before the commission. 235 Any member or employee or former member or employee of 236 the commission who violates this subsection is subject to the 237 penalties contained in subsection (e), section ten of this 238 article. In addition, violation of this subsection by a current 239 member or employee of the Commission is grounds for 240 immediate removal from office or termination of 241 employment.
  - (p) A complainant may be assisted by a member of the Commission staff assigned by the commission after a determination of probable cause.
- 245 (q) No employee of the commission assigned to prosecute 246 a complaint may participate in the commission deliberations 247 or communicate with commission members or the public 248 concerning the merits of a complaint.
- (r) (1) If the commission finds by evidence beyond a reasonable doubt that the facts alleged in the complaint are true and constitute a material violation of this article, it may impose one or more of the following sanctions:

243

(B) Cease and desist orders;

272

273

274

275

276

277

278

279

280

- 255 (C) Orders of restitution for money, things of value, or 256 services taken or received in violation of this chapter;
- 257 (D) Fines not to exceed five thousand dollars per 258 violation; or
- 259 (E) Reimbursement to the commission for the actual costs 260 of investigating and prosecuting a violation. Any 261 reimbursement ordered by the commission for its costs under 262 this paragraph shall be collected by the commission and 263 deposited into the special revenue account created pursuant 264 to section six, article one of this chapter.
- 265 (2) In addition to imposing the above-specified sanctions, 266 the commission may recommend to the appropriate 267 governmental body that a respondent be terminated from 268 employment or removed from office.
- 269 (3) The commission may institute civil proceedings in the 270 circuit court of the county in which a violation occurred for 271 the enforcement of sanctions.
  - (s) At any stage of the proceedings under this section, the commission may enter into a conciliation agreement with a respondent if the agreement is deemed by a majority of the members of the commission to be in the best interest of the state and the respondent. Any conciliation agreement must be disclosed to the public: *Provided*, That negotiations leading to a conciliation agreement, as well as information obtained by the commission during the negotiations, shall remain confidential except as may be otherwise set forth in the agreement.
- 282 (t) Decisions of the commission involving the issuance of 283 sanctions may be appealed to the circuit court of Kanawha

- 284 County, only by the respondent and only upon the grounds
- set forth in section four, article five, chapter twenty- nine-a
- 286 of this code.
- (u) (1) Any person who in good faith files a verified complaint or any person, official or agency who gives credible information resulting in a formal complaint filed by commission staff is immune from any civil liability that otherwise might result by reason of such actions.
- 292 (2) If the commission determines, by clear and 293 convincing evidence, that a person filed a complaint or 294 provided information which resulted in an investigation 295 knowing that the material statements in the complaint or the 296 investigation request or the information provided were not true; filed an unsubstantiated complaint or request for an 297 298 investigation in reckless disregard of the truth or falsity of the 299 statements contained therein; or filed one or more unsubstantiated complaints which constituted abuse of 300 301 process, the commission shall:
- 302 (A) Order the complainant or informant to reimburse the respondent for his or her reasonable costs;
- 304 (B) Order the complainant or informant to reimburse the respondent for his or her reasonable attorney fees; and
- 306 (C) Order the complainant or informant to reimburse the 307 commission for the actual costs of its investigation. In 308 addition, the commission may decline to process any further 309 complaints brought by the complainant, the initiator of the 310 investigation or the informant.
- 311 (3) The sanctions authorized in this subsection are not 312 exclusive and do not preclude any other remedies or rights of 313 action the respondent may have against the complainant or 314 informant under the law.

315 (v) (1) If at any stage in the proceedings under this 316 section it appears to a Review Board, a hearing examiner or 317 the commission that there is credible information or evidence 318 that the respondent may have committed a criminal violation, 319 the matter shall be referred to the full commission for its 320 consideration. If, by a vote of two thirds of the members of 321 the full commission, it is determined that probable cause 322 exists to believe a criminal violation has occurred, the 323 commission shall refer the matter to the appropriate county prosecuting attorney having jurisdiction for a criminal 324 325 investigation and possible prosecution. Deliberations of the 326 commission with regard to referring a matter for criminal 327 investigation by a prosecuting attorney shall be private and 328 confidential. Notwithstanding any other provision of this 329 article, once a referral for criminal investigation is made 330 under the provisions of this subsection, the ethics proceedings 33 L shall be held in abeyance until action on the referred matter 332 is concluded. If the referral of the matter to the prosecuting 333 attorney results in a criminal conviction of the respondent, 334 the commission may resume its investigation or prosecution 335 of the ethics violation, but may not impose a fine as a 336 sanction if a violation is found to have occurred.

(2) If fewer than two thirds of the full commission determine that a criminal violation has occurred, the commission shall remand the matter to the Review Board, the hearing examiner or the commission itself as a hearing board, as the case may be, for further proceedings under this article.

337

338

339

340

341

342

343

344

345

346

347348

349

(w) The provisions of this section shall apply to violations of this chapter occurring after the thirtieth day of September, one thousand nine hundred eighty-nine, and within one year before the filing of a complaint: *Provided*, That the applicable statute of limitations for violations which occur on or after the first day of July, two thousand five, is two years after the date on which the alleged violation occurred.

### §6B-2-5. Ethical standards for elected and appointed officials and public employees.

- 1 (a) Persons subject to section. -- The provisions of this 2 section apply to all elected and appointed public officials and 3 public employees, whether full or part time, in state, county, 4 municipal governments and their respective boards, agencies, 5 departments and commissions and in any other regional or 6 local governmental agency, including county school boards.
- 7 (b) Use of public office for private gain. -- (1) A public official or public employee may not knowingly and 8 9 intentionally use his or her office or the prestige of his or her 10 office for his or her own private gain or that of another 11 person. Incidental use of equipment or resources available to 12 a public official or public employee by virtue of his or her 13 position for personal or business purposes resulting in de 14 minimis private gain does not constitute use of public office for private gain under this subsection. The performance of 15 16 usual and customary duties associated with the office or 17 position or the advancement of public policy goals or 18 constituent services, without compensation, does not 19 constitute the use of prestige of office for private gain.
- 20 (2) Notwithstanding the general prohibition against use 21 of office for private gain, public officials and public 22 employees may use bonus points acquired through 23 participation in frequent traveler programs while traveling on official government business; Provided, that the official's or 24 25 employee's participation in such program, or acquisition of 26 such points, does not result in additional costs to the 27 government.
- 28 (3) The Legislature, in enacting this subsection, 29 recognizes that there may be certain public officials or public 30 employees who bring to their respective offices or 31 employment their own unique personal prestige which is

64

65

66 67

her office or employment.

33 34 these persons bring a personal prestige to their office or 35 employment which inures to the benefit of the state and its 36 citizens. Those persons may, in fact, be sought by the state to 37 serve in their office or employment because, through their 38 unusual gifts or traits, they bring stature and recognition to 39 their office or employment and to the state itself. While the 40 office or employment held or to be held by those persons 41 may have its own inherent prestige, it would be unfair to 42 those individuals and against the best interests of the citizens 43 of this state to deny those persons the right to hold public 44 office or to be publicly employed on the grounds that they 45 would, in addition to the emoluments of their office or 46 employment, be in a position to benefit financially from the 47 personal prestige which otherwise inheres to them. 48 Accordingly, the commission is directed, by legislative rule, 49 to establish categories of public officials and public 50 employees, identifying them generally by the office or 51 employment held, and offering persons who fit within those 52 categories the opportunity to apply for an exemption from the 53 application of the provisions of this subsection. Exemptions 54 may be granted by the commission, on a case-by-case basis, 55 when it is shown that: (A) The public office held or the 56 public employment engaged in is not such that it would 57 ordinarily be available or offered to a substantial number of 58 the citizens of this state; (B) the office held or the 59 employment engaged in is such that it normally or 60 specifically requires a person who possesses personal 61 prestige; and (C) the person's employment contract or letter 62 of appointment provides or anticipates that the person will gain financially from activities which are not a part of his or 63

(c) Gifts. -- (1) A public official or public employee may not solicit any gift unless the solicitation is for a charitable purpose with no resulting direct pecuniary benefit conferred

- 68 upon the official or employee or his or her immediate family:
- 69 *Provided*, That no public official or public employee may
- solicit for a charitable purpose any gift from any person who
- 71 is also an official or employee of the state and whose position
- 72 is subordinate to the soliciting official or employee:
- 73 Provided, however, That nothing herein shall prohibit a
- 74 candidate for public office from soliciting a lawful political
- 75 contribution. No official or employee may knowingly accept
- any gift, directly or indirectly, from a lobbyist or from any
- 77 person whom the official or employee knows or has reason
- 78 to know:
- 79 (A) Is doing or seeking to do business of any kind with
- 80 his or her agency;
- 81 (B) Is engaged in activities which are regulated or
- 82 controlled by his or her agency; or
- 83 (C) Has financial interests which may be substantially
- 84 and materially affected, in a manner distinguishable from the
- 85 public generally, by the performance or nonperformance of
- 86 his or her official duties.
- 87 (2) Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision (1) of
- 88 this subsection, a person who is a public official or public
- 89 employee may accept a gift described in this subdivision, and
- 90 there shall be a presumption that the receipt of such gift does
- 91 not impair the impartiality and independent judgment of the
- 92 person. This presumption may be rebutted only by direct
- 93 objective evidence that the gift did impair the impartiality and
- 94 independent judgment of the person or that the person knew
- or had reason to know that the gift was offered with the intent
- 96 to impair his or her impartiality and independent judgment.
- 97 The provisions of subdivision (1) of this subsection do not
- 98 apply to:

100 101	(B) Ceremonial gifts or awards which have insignificant monetary value;
102 103	(C) Unsolicited gifts of nominal value or trivial items of informational value;
104 105 106	(D) Reasonable expenses for food, travel and lodging of the official or employee for a meeting at which the official or employee participates in a panel or has a speaking
107	engagement;
108 109 110 111	(E) Gifts of tickets or free admission extended to a public official or public employee to attend charitable, cultural or political events, if the purpose of such gift or admission is a courtesy or ceremony customarily extended to the office;
112	(F) Gifts that are purely private and personal in nature; or
113 114	(G) Gifts from relatives by blood or marriage, or a member of the same household.
115 116 117 118 119 120	(3) The commission shall, through legislative rule promulgated pursuant to chapter twenty-nine-a of this code, establish guidelines for the acceptance of a reasonable honorarium by public officials and elected officials. The rule promulgated shall be consistent with this section. Any elected public official may accept an honorarium only when:
121	(A) That official is a part-time elected public official;
122 123	(B) The fee is not related to the official's public position or duties;
124 125	(C) The fee is for services provided by the public official that are related to the public official's regular, nonpublic
126	trade, profession, occupation, hobby or avocation; and

- 127 (D) The honorarium is not provided in exchange for any promise or action on the part of the public official.
- 129 (4) Nothing in this section shall be construed so as to 130 prohibit the giving of a lawful political contribution as 131 defined by law.
- 132 (5) The Governor or his designee may, in the name of the 133 state of West Virginia, accept and receive gifts from any 134 public or private source. Any gift so obtained shall become 135 the property of the state and shall, within thirty days of the 136 receipt thereof, be registered with the commission and the 137 Division of Culture and History.
- 138 (6) Upon prior approval of the Joint Committee on 139 Government and Finance, any member of the Legislature 140 may solicit donations for a regional or national legislative 141 organization conference or other legislative organization function to be held in the state for the purpose of deferring 142 143 costs to the state for hosting of the conference or function. 144 Legislative organizations are bipartisan regional or national 145 organizations in which the Joint Committee on Government and Finance authorizes payment of dues or other membership 146 fees for the Legislature's participation and which assist this 147 148 and other state legislatures and their staff through any of the 149 following:
- 150 (A) Advancing the effectiveness, independence and 151 integrity of legislatures in the states of the United States;
- 152 (B) Fostering interstate cooperation and facilitating information exchange among state legislatures;
- 154 (C) Representing the states and their legislatures in the 155 American federal system of government;

- 156 (D) Improving the operations and management of state 157 legislatures and the effectiveness of legislators and legislative 158 staff, and to encourage the practice of high standards of
- 159 conduct by legislators and legislative staff;
- 160 (E) Promoting cooperation between state legislatures in 161 the United States and legislatures in other countries.
- 162 The solicitations may only be made in writing. The 163 legislative organization may act as fiscal agent for the 164 conference and receive all donations. In the alternative, a 165 bona fide banking institution may act as the fiscal agent. The 166 official letterhead of the Legislature may not be used by the 167 legislative member in conjunction with the fund raising or 168 solicitation effort. The legislative organization for which 169 solicitations are being made shall file with the Joint 170 Committee on Government and Finance and with the 171 Secretary of State for publication in the State Register as provided in article two of chapter twenty-nine-a of the code, 172 173 copies of letters, brochures and other solicitation documents, 174 along with a complete list of the names and last known 175 addresses of all donors and the amount of donations received. 176 Any solicitation by a legislative member shall contain the 177 following disclaimer:
- "This solicitation is endorsed by [name of member]. This endorsement does not imply support of the soliciting organization, nor of the sponsors who may respond to the solicitation. A copy of all solicitations are on file with the West Virginia Legislature's Joint Committee on Government and Finance, and with the Secretary of State and are available for public review."
- 185 (7) Upon written notice to the commission, any member 186 of the Board of Public Works may solicit donations for a 187 regional or national organization conference or other function

related to the office of the member to be held in the state for 188 189 the purpose of deferring costs to the state for hosting of the 190 conference or function. The solicitations may only be made 191 in writing. The organization may act as fiscal agent for the 192 conference and receive all donations. In the alternative, a 193 bona fide banking institution may act as the fiscal agent. The 194 official letterhead of the office of the Board of Public Works 195 member may not be used in conjunction with the fund raising or solicitation effort. The organization for which solicitations 196 197 are being made shall file with the Joint Committee on Government and Finance, with the Secretary of State for 198 199 publication in the State Register as provided in article two of 200 chapter twenty-nine-a of the code and with the commission, copies of letters, brochures and other solicitation documents, 201 202 along with a complete list of the names and last known 203 addresses of all donors and the amount of donations received. 204 Any solicitation by a member of the Board of Public Works 205 shall contain the following disclaimer: "This solicitation is 206 endorsed by (name of member of Board of Public Works.) 207 This endorsement does not imply support of the soliciting organization, nor of the sponsors who may respond to the 209 solicitation. Copies of all solicitations are on file with the West Virginia Legislature's Joint Committee on Government and Finance, with the West Virginia Secretary of State and with the West Virginia Ethics Commission and are available for public review." Any moneys in excess of those donations needed for the conference or function shall be deposited in the Capitol Dome and Capitol Improvement Fund established in section two, article four of chapter five-a of this code.

#### (d) Interests in public contracts. -

208

210

211

212

213

214

215

216

217

218

219

220

221

222

223

(1) In addition to the provisions of section fifteen, article ten, chapter sixty-one of this code, no elected or appointed public official or public employee or member of his or her immediate family or business with which he or she is associated may be a party to or have an interest in the profits or benefits of a contract which the official or employee may 224 have direct authority to enter into, or over which he or she 225 may have control: *Provided*, That nothing herein shall be 226 construed to prevent or make unlawful the employment of 227 any person with any governmental body: Provided, however, 228 That nothing herein shall be construed to prohibit a member 229 of the Legislature from entering into a contract with any 230 governmental body, or prohibit a part-time appointed public 231 official from entering into a contract which the part-time 232 appointed public official may have direct authority to enter 233 into or over which he or she may have control when the 234 official has not participated in the review or evaluation 235 thereof, has been recused from deciding or evaluating and has 236 been excused from voting on the contract and has fully 237 disclosed the extent of his or her interest in the contract.

238

239

240

241

242

243

244

245

246

- (2) In the absence of bribery or a purpose to defraud, an elected or appointed public official or public employee or a member of his or her immediate family or a business with which he or she is associated shall not be considered as having a prohibited financial interest in a public contract when such a person has a limited interest as an owner, shareholder or creditor of the business which is awarded a public contract. A limited interest for the purposes of this subsection is:
- 247 (A) An interest which does not exceed one thousand 248 dollars in the profits or benefits of the public contract or contracts in a calendar year;
- 250 (B) An interest as a creditor of a public employee or 251 official who exercises control over the contract, or a member of his or her immediate family, if the amount is less than five 252 253 thousand dollars.
- 254 (3) If a public official or employee has an interest in the 255 profits or benefits of a contract, then he or she may not make, participate in making, or in any way attempt to use his office 256

- or employment to influence a government decision affecting
- 258 his or her financial or limited financial interest. Public
- officials shall also comply with the voting rules prescribed in
- 260 subsection (j) of this section.
- (4) Where the provisions of subdivisions (1) and (2) of 261 262 this subsection would result in the loss of a quorum in a 263 public body or agency, in excessive cost, undue hardship, or 264 other substantial interference with the operation of a state, 265 county, municipality, county school board or other 266 governmental agency, the affected governmental body or 267 agency may make written application to the Ethics 268 Commission for an exemption from subdivisions (1) and (2) 269 of this subsection.
- (e) Confidential information. -- No present or former public official or employee may knowingly and improperly disclose any confidential information acquired by him or her in the course of his or her official duties nor use such information to further his or her personal interests or the interests of another person.
- 276 (f) Prohibited representation. -- No present or former 277 elected or appointed public official or public employee shall, 278 during or after his or her public employment or service, 279 represent a client or act in a representative capacity with or without compensation on behalf of any person in a contested 280 281 case, rate-making proceeding, license or permit application, 282 regulation filing or other particular matter involving a 283 specific party or parties which arose during his or her period of public service or employment and in which he or she 284 285 personally and substantially participated in a decision-286 making, advisory or staff support capacity, unless the 287 appropriate government agency, after consultation, consents to such representation. A staff attorney, accountant or other 288 289 professional employee who has represented a government 290 agency in a particular matter shall not thereafter represent

291 another client in the same or substantially related matter in 292 which that client's interests are materially adverse to the 293 interests of the government agency, without the consent of 294 the government agency: *Provided*, That this prohibition on 295 representation shall not apply when the client was not directly 296 involved in the particular matter in which the professional 297 employee represented the government agency, but was 298 involved only as a member of a class. The provisions of this 299 subsection shall not apply to legislators who were in office 300 and legislative staff who were employed at the time it 301 originally became effective on the first day of July, one 302 thousand nine hundred eighty-nine, and those who have since 303 become legislators or legislative staff and those who shall 304 serve hereafter as legislators or legislative staff.

- (g) Limitation on practice before a board, agency, commission or department. -- Except as otherwise provided in section three, four or five, article two, chapter eight-a of this code: (1) No elected or appointed public official and no full-time staff attorney or accountant shall, during his or her public service or public employment or for a period of one year after the termination of his or her public service or public employment with a governmental entity authorized to hear contested cases or promulgate or propose rules, appear in a representative capacity before the governmental entity in which he or she serves or served or is or was employed in the following matters:
- 317 (A) A contested case involving an administrative 318 sanction, action or refusal to act;
- 319 (B) To support or oppose a proposed rule;
- 320 (C) To support or contest the issuance or denial of a 321 license or permit;
- 322 (D) A rate-making proceeding; and

305

306

307

308

309

310

311

312

313

314

315

- 323 (E) To influence the expenditure of public funds.
- 324 (2) As used in this subsection, "represent" includes any 325 formal or informal appearance before, or any written or oral 326 communication with, any public agency on behalf of any person: Provided, That nothing contained in this subsection 327 328 shall prohibit, during any period, a former public official or 329 employee from being retained by or employed to represent, 330 assist or act in a representative capacity on behalf of the 331 public agency by which he or she was employed or in which 332 he or she served. Nothing in this subsection shall be 333 construed to prevent a former public official or employee 334 from representing another state, county, municipal or other 335 governmental entity before the governmental entity in which 336 he or she served or was employed within one year after the 337 termination of his or her employment or service in the entity.
- 338 (3) A present or former public official or employee may 339 appear at any time in a representative capacity before the 340 Legislature, a county commission, city or town council or 341 county school board in relation to the consideration of a 342 statute, budget, ordinance, rule, resolution or enactment.
- 343 (4) Members and former members of the Legislature and 344 professional employees and former professional employees 345 of the Legislature shall be permitted to appear in a 346 representative capacity on behalf of clients before any 347 governmental agency of the state or of county or municipal 348 governments, including county school boards.
- 349 (5) An elected or appointed public official, full-time staff 350 attorney or accountant who would be adversely affected by 351 the provisions of this subsection may apply to the Ethics 352 Commission for an exemption from the one year prohibition 353 against appearing in a representative capacity, when the 354 person's education and experience is such that the prohibition 355 would, for all practical purposes, deprive the person of the

- ability to earn a livelihood in this state outside of the governmental agency. The Ethics Commission shall by legislative rule establish general guidelines or standards for granting an exemption or reducing the time period, but shall decide each application on a case-by-case basis.
- 361 (h) Employment by regulated persons and vendors. -- (1)
  362 No full-time official or full-time public employee may seek
  363 employment with, be employed by, or seek to purchase, sell
  364 or lease real or personal property to or from any person who:
- 365 (A) Had a matter on which he or she took, or a 366 subordinate is known to have taken, regulatory action within 367 the preceding twelve months; or
- 368 (B) Has a matter before the agency on which he or she is 369 working or a subordinate is known by him or her to be 370 working.
- 371 (C) Is a vendor to the agency where the official serves or 372 public employee is employed and the official or public 373 employee, or a subordinate of the official or public employee, 374 exercises authority or control over a public contract with such 375 vendor, including, but not limited to:
- 376 (i) Drafting bid specifications or requests for proposals;
- 377 (ii) Recommending selection of the vendor;
- 378 (iii) Conducting inspections or investigations,
- 379 (iv) Approving the method or manner of payment to the vendor;
- 381 (v) Providing legal or technical guidance on the 382 formation, implementation or execution of the contract; or,

- 383 (vi) Taking other nonministerial action which may affect 384 the financial interests of the vendor.
- 385 (2) Within the meaning of this section, the term 386 "employment" includes professional services and other 387 services rendered by the public official or public employee. 388 whether rendered as employee or as an independent 389 contractor; "seek employment" includes responding to 390 unsolicited offers of employment as well as any direct or 391 indirect contact with a potential employer relating to the 392 availability or conditions of employment in furtherance of 393 obtaining employment; and "subordinate" includes only those 394 agency personnel over whom the public official or public 395 employee has supervisory responsibility.
- 396 (3) A full-time public official or full-time public 397 employee who would be adversely affected by the provisions 398 of this subsection may apply to the Ethics Commission for an 399 exemption from the prohibition contained in subdivision (1) 400 of this subsection.
- 401 (A) The Ethics Commission shall by legislative rule 402 establish general guidelines or standards for granting an 403 exemption, but shall decide each application on a case-by-404 case basis;
- (B) A person adversely affected by the restriction on the purchase of personal property may make such purchase after seeking and obtaining approval from the commission or in good faith reliance upon an official guideline promulgated by the commission, written advisory opinions issued by the commission, or a Legislative Rule.
- 411 (C) The commission may establish exceptions to the 412 personal property purchase restrictions through the adoption 413 of guidelines, advisory opinions or legislative rule.

- 414 (4) A full-time public official or full-time public 415 employee may not take personal regulatory action on a matter 416 affecting a person by whom he or she is employed or with 417 whom he or she is seeking employment or has an agreement 418 concerning future employment.
- 419 (5) A full-time public official or full-time public 420 employee may not personally participate in a decision, 421 approval, disapproval, recommendation, rendering advice, 422 investigation, inspection or other substantial exercise of 423 nonministerial administrative discretion involving a vendor 424 with whom he or she is seeking employment or has an 425 agreement concerning future employment.
- 426 (6) A full-time public official or full-time public 427 employee may not receive private compensation for 428 providing information or services that he or she is required to 429 provide in carrying out his or her public job responsibilities.
- 430 (i) Members of the Legislature required to vote. --431 Members of the Legislature who have asked to be excused 432 from voting or who have made inquiry as to whether they 433 should be excused from voting on a particular matter and 434 who are required by the presiding officer of the House of 435 Delegates or Senate of West Virginia to vote under the rules 436 of the particular house shall not be guilty of any violation of 437 ethics under the provisions of this section for a vote so cast.

# (j) Limitations on Voting.

438

- 439 (1) Public officials, excluding members of the Legislature 440 who are governed by subsection (i) of this section, may not 441 vote on a matter:
- 442 (A) In which they, an immediate family member, or a 443 business with which they or an immediate family member is 444 associated have a financial interest. Business with which

- they are associated means a business of which the person or
- an immediate family member is a director, officer, owner,
- 447 employee, compensated agent, or holder of stock which
- 448 constitutes five percent or more of the total outstanding
- 449 stocks of any class.
- 450 (B) If a public official is employed by a financial 451 institution and his or her primary responsibilities include 452 consumer and commercial lending, the public official may 453 not vote on a matter which directly affects the financial interests of a customer of the financial institution if the public 454 455 official is directly involved in approving a loan request from 456 the person or business appearing before the governmental 457 body or if the public official has been directly involved in 458 approving a loan for that person or business within the past 12 months: *Provided*, That, this limitation only applies if the 459 460 total amount of the loan or loans exceeds fifteen thousand 461 dollars.
- 462 (C) A personnel matter involving the public official's spouse or relative;
- (D) The appropriations of public moneys or the awarding of a contract to a nonprofit corporation if the public official or an immediate family member is employed by the nonprofit.

# (II) A public official may vote:

468

(A) If the public official, his or her spouse, immediate family members or relatives or business with which they are associated are affected as a member of, and to no greater extent than any other member of a profession, occupation, class of persons or class of businesses. A class shall consist of not fewer than five similarly situated persons or businesses; or

484

485 486

487

488

489

490

491

492

493

494 495

496

497

498

499

500 501

502

503504

505

506

507

508

- (B) If the matter affects a publicly traded company when:
- 477 (i) The public official, or dependent family members 478 individually or jointly own less than five percent of the issued 479 stock in the publicly traded company and the value of the 480 stocks individually or jointly owned is less than ten thousand 481 dollars; and
- 482 (ii) Prior to casting a vote the public official discloses his 483 or her interest in the publicly traded company.
  - (3) For a public official's recusal to be effective, it is necessary to excuse him or herself from participating in the discussion and decision-making process by physically removing him or herself from the room during the period, fully disclosing his or her interests, and recusing him or herself from voting on the issue.
  - (k) Limitations on participation in licensing and ratemaking proceedings. -- No public official or employee may participate within the scope of his or her duties as a public official or employee, except through ministerial functions as defined in section three, article one of this chapter, in any license or rate-making proceeding that directly affects the license or rates of any person, partnership, trust, business trust, corporation or association in which the public official or employee or his or her immediate family owns or controls more than ten percent. No public official or public employee may participate within the scope of his or her duties as a public official or public employee, except through ministerial functions as defined in section three, article one of this chapter, in any license or rate-making proceeding that directly affects the license or rates of any person to whom the public official or public employee or his or her immediate family, or a partnership, trust, business trust, corporation or association of which the public official or employee, or his or her immediate family, owns or controls more than ten

- percent, has sold goods or services totaling more than one 509 510 thousand dollars during the preceding year, unless the public 511 official or public employee has filed a written statement 512 acknowledging such sale with the public agency and the 513 statement is entered in any public record of the agency's 514 proceedings. This subsection shall not be construed to require 515 the disclosure of clients of attorneys or of patients or clients 516 of persons licensed pursuant to article three, eight, fourteen, 517 fourteen-a, fifteen, sixteen, twenty, twenty-one or thirty-one, 518 chapter thirty of this code.
- (1) Certain compensation prohibited. -- (1) A public employee may not receive additional compensation from another publicly- funded state, county or municipal office or employment for working the same hours, unless:
- 523 (A) The public employee's compensation from one public 524 employer is reduced by the amount of compensation received 525 from the other public employer;
- 526 (B) The public employee's compensation from one public 527 employer is reduced on a pro rata basis for any work time 528 missed to perform duties for the other public employer;
- (C) The public employee uses earned paid vacation, personal or compensatory time or takes unpaid leave from his or her public employment to perform the duties of another public office or employment; or
- 533 (D) A part-time public employee who does not have 534 regularly scheduled work hours or a public employee who is 535 authorized by one public employer to make up, outside of 536 regularly scheduled work hours, time missed to perform the 537 duties of another public office or employment maintains time 538 records, verified by the public employee and his or her 539 immediate supervisor at least once every pay period, showing 540 the hours that the public employee did, in fact, work for each

- public employer. The public employer shall submit these time
   records to the Ethics Commission on a quarterly basis.
- 543 (2) This section does not prohibit a retired public official 544 or public employee from receiving compensation from a 545 publicly- funded office or employment in addition to any 546 retirement benefits to which the retired public official or 547 public employee is entitled.
- 548 (m) Certain expenses prohibited. -- No public official or 549 public employee shall knowingly request or accept from any 550 governmental entity compensation or reimbursement for any 551 expenses actually paid by a lobbyist and required by the 552 provisions of this chapter to be reported, or actually paid by 553 any other person.
- 554 (n) Any person who is employed as a member of the 555 faculty or staff of a public institution of higher education and 556 who is engaged in teaching, research, consulting or 557 publication activities in his or her field of expertise with 558 public or private entities and thereby derives private benefits 559 from such activities shall be exempt from the prohibitions 560 contained in subsections (b), (c) and (d) of this section when 561 the activity is approved as a part of an employment contract 562 with the governing board of the institution or has been 563 approved by the employee's department supervisor or the 564 president of the institution by which the faculty or staff 565 member is employed.
- 566 (o) Except as provided in this section, a person who is a 567 public official or public employee may not solicit private 568 business from a subordinate public official or public 569 employee whom he or she has the authority to direct, 570 supervise or control. A person who is a public official or public employee may solicit private business from a 571 572 subordinate public official or public employee whom he or 573 she has the authority to direct, supervise or control when:

#### Enr. Com. Sub. for H. B. 4524] 42

- 574 (A) The solicitation is a general solicitation directed to 575 the public at large through the mailing or other means of 576 distribution of a letter, pamphlet, handbill, circular or other 577 written or printed media; or
- 578 (B) The solicitation is limited to the posting of a notice in 579 a communal work area; or
- 580 (C) The solicitation is for the sale of property of a kind 581 that the person is not regularly engaged in selling; or
- 582 (D) The solicitation is made at the location of a private 583 business owned or operated by the person to which the 584 subordinate public official or public employee has come on 585 his or her own initiative.
- 586 (p) The commission may, by legislative rule promulgated 587 in accordance with chapter twenty-nine-a of this code, define 588 further exemptions from this section as necessary or 589 appropriate.

### ARTICLE 3. LOBBYISTS.

## §6B-3-3c. Lobbyist training course.

1 The commission shall provide a training course for 2 registered lobbyists and prospective lobbyists at least twice 3 each year regarding the provisions of the ethics code relevant 4 to lobbyists. One such course shall be conducted during the 5 month of January. In addition to the registration fees 6 authorized in section three-a of this article, the commission 7 may collect a reasonable fee established by legislative rule 8 authorized pursuant to article three, chapter twenty-nine-a of 9 this code from those attending lobbyist training, which is to 10 be collected by the Ethics Commission and deposited pursuant to section six, article one of this chapter. To 11 12 maintain registration and engage in lobbying activities, a

- 13 lobbyist must complete one such training course during each
- 14 two-year registration cycle as described in section three-a of
- 15 this article: *Provided*, That a lobbyist must attend such
- 16 training course prior to engaging in lobbying activities.

#### §6B-3-4. Reporting by lobbyists.

- 1 (a) A registered lobbyist shall file with the commission
- 2 reports of his or her lobbying activities, signed by the
- 3 lobbyist. The reports shall be filed three times a year as
- 4 follows:
- 5 (1) On or before the fifteenth day of May, a lobbyist shall
- 6 report all lobbying activities in which he or she engaged from
- 7 the first day of January through the thirtieth day of April.
- 8 (2) On or before the fifteenth day of September, a
- 9 lobbyist shall report all lobbying activities in which he or she
- 10 engaged from the first day of May through the thirty-first day
- 11 of August;
- 12 (3) On or before the fifteenth day of January, a lobbyist
- 13 shall report all lobbying activities in which he or she engaged
- 14 from the first day of September through the thirty-first day of
- 15 December.
- 16 (b) If the date on which a lobbyist expenditure report is
- 17 due falls on a Saturday, Sunday or legal holiday, the report
- 18 will be considered timely filed if it is postmarked not later
- 19 than the next business day. If a registered lobbyist files a late
- 20 report, the lobbyist shall pay the commission a fee of ten
- 21 dollars for each late day, not to exceed a total of two hundred
- 22
- fifty dollars. If a registered lobbyist fails to file a report or to 23 pay the required fee for filing an untimely report, the
- commission may, after written notice sent by certified mail, 24
- 25 return receipt requested, suspend the lobbyist's privileges as
- 26 a registered lobbyist until the lobbyist has satisfactorily

- complied with all reporting requirements and paid the required fee.
- 29 (c)(1) Except as otherwise provided in this section, each 30 report filed by a lobbyist shall show the total amount of all 31 expenditures for lobbying activities made or incurred by on 32 behalf of the lobbyist during the period covered by the report. 33 The report shall also show subtotals segregated according to 34 financial category, including meals and beverages; living 35 accommodations; advertising; travel; contributions; gifts to 36 public officials or employees or to members of the immediate 37 family of a public official or employee; and other expenses 38 or services.
- 39 (2) Lobbyists are not required to report the following:
- 40 (A) Unreimbursed personal living and travel expenses not incurred directly for lobbying;
- 42 (B) Any expenses incurred for the lobbyist's own living accommodations;
- 44 (C) Any expenses incurred for the lobbyist's own travel 45 to and from public meetings or hearings of the legislative and 46 executive branches; or
- 47 (D) Any expenses incurred for telephone and any office 48 expenses, including rent and salaries and wages paid for staff 49 and secretarial assistance.
- (d) If a lobbyist is employed by more than one employer, the report shall show the proportionate amount of the expenditures in each category incurred on behalf of each of his or her employers.
- 54 (e) The report shall describe the subject matter of the lobbying activities in which the lobbyist has been engaged during the reporting period.

(f) If, during the period covered by the report, the lobbyist made expenditures or expenditures were made or incurred on behalf of the lobbyist in the reporting categories of meals and beverages, living accommodations, travel, gifts or other expenditures, other than for those expenditures governed by subsection (g) of this section, the lobbyist shall 63 report the name of the public official or employee to whom 64 or on whose behalf the expenditures were made, the total 65 amount of the expenditures, and the subject matter of the 66 lobbying activity, if any: *Provided*, That a registered lobbyist 67 who entertains more than one public official or public 68 employee at a time with meals and beverages complies with 69 the provisions of this section if he or she reports the names of 70 the public officials or public employees entertained and the 71 total amount expended for meals and beverages for all of the 72 public officials or public employees entertained: *Provided*, 73 however, That where several lobbyists join in entertaining 74 one or more public officials or public employees at a time 75 with meals and beverages, each lobbyist complies with the 76 provisions of this section by reporting the names of the public 77 officials or public employees entertained and his or her 78 proportionate share of the total amount expended for meals 79 and beverages for all of the public officials or public 80 employees entertained. Under this subsection, no portion of 81 the amount of an expenditure for a dinner, party or other 82 function sponsored by a lobbyist's employer need be 83 attributed to a particular public official or employee who 84 attends the function if the sponsor has invited to the function 85 all the members of: (1) The Legislature; (2) either house of the Legislature; (3) a standing or select committee of either 86 87 house; or (4) a joint committee of the two houses of the Legislature. However, the amount spent for the function shall 88 89 be added to other expenditures for the purpose of determining 90 the total amount of expenditures reported under subdivision 91 (1), subsection (c) of this section: Provided further, That if 92 the expenditure is for a function to which the entire 93 membership of the Legislature has been invited, the lobbyist

57

58

59

60 61

62

### Enr. Com. Sub. for H. B. 4524] 46

- need only report that fact, the total amount of the expenditure and the subject matter of the lobbying activity.
- (g) If, during the period covered by the report, the 96 97 lobbyist made expenditures in the reporting categories of 98 meals and beverages, lodging, travel, gifts and scheduled 99 entertainment for or on behalf of a particular public official or public employee in return for the participation of the 100 public official or employee in a panel or speaking 101 102 engagement at a meeting, the lobbyist shall report the name of the public official or employee to whom or on whose 103 104 behalf the expenditures were made and the total amount of 105 the expenditures.

Góvernor

Chairman Senate Committee Chairman House Committee Originating in the House. In effect from passage. Clerk of the Senate Clerk of the House of Delegates President of the Senate of the House of Delegates day of 2008.

PRESENTED TO THE GOVERNOR

MAR 2 6 2008

Time

•